ALITA NANDI
'Ethnic and racial harassment and mental health: Identifying sources of resilience.'
Mental Health Symposium April 21st 2018

Today's presentation is being transcribed so those without audio or who require text only can participate in real time.
A little explanation about this service.
Voice-to-text transcriptionists provide a translation of the key ideas discussed, NOT a word for word transcription.
Voice-to-text services provide an in-the-moment snapshot of ideas and concepts, so that those who are unable to hear or to understand the audio program are able to participate in real-time.
You will see the transcription in local chat.
Transcription is provided by Virtual Ability, Inc.
The transcriptionists are:
Elektra Panthar
LoriVonne Lustre
The following initials in the transcription record will identify the speakers:
AN: Alita Nandi

[2018/04/21 13:19] Losairam Pelliot: It is a great pleasure for me to welcome you to this important event in Virtual Ability.
My name is Losairam Pelliot, I live in Quito the capital of Ecuador, a small and beautiful country in South América.
I am a teacher in virtual classes as a volunteer in FATLA, a digital community that seeks to share information, and build new knowledge to achieve technological upgrading in Latin America.
I have a masters degree in Psychopedagogy and I also work with children with learning differences.
I would like to introduce Dr. Alita Nandi. She will speak today about "Ethnic and racial harassment and mental health: Identifying sources of resilience."
Dr. Nandi is a Research Fellow at the Institute for Social and Economic Research, University of Essex. She conducts empirical research primarily about ethnicity and gender.
She is interested in the formation and measurement of identity, discrimination and harassment.
She co-leads the Ethnicity strand of Understanding Society, UK's largest household panel survey. She has co-authored a book, “A Practical Guide to Using Panel Data”. With many ethnic minorities in England reporting harassment, this causes mental health problems.
Using data from the panel survey, her research found different factors that aided resilience for first and second generation ethnic minorities.
I remind you not to type or talk until the end. Dr. Nandi, please, go ahead with your presentation.


[2018/04/21 13:22] alitanandi Resident: (slide 1)
Hi, I am Alita Nandi from the University of Essex. Thank you for inviting me. I will talk about the findings from this project. My project team members are Renee Luthra, Michaela Benzeval and Shamit Saggar.

(slide 2)
For over a decade researchers have been trying to understand the reasons for poorer health of ethnic minorities as compared to the ethnic majority in a country, both physical and mental health. In this paper, James Nazroo questions the hypothesis that this difference is due to inherent genetic or cultural differences across ethnic groups. He provides alternative explanations. These are basically differences in the life circumstances across ethnic groups.

(slide 3)
Many ethnic minority groups may have poorer economic outcomes than the white majority. Poverty, economic hardship is expected to affect a person’s health. So, that could be one explanation.

(slide 4 shows data table of racial harassment, discrimination, occupational class, and risk of fair or poor health)
Using data from a 1994 survey of British residents, he shows that ethnic minorities living in households with no working member, or in manual occupations are more likely to report poorer health than those in non-manual occupations.

(slide 5)
Next he suggests that having the perception that you are the member of an ethnic group which is treated unfairly, considered to be of low status may also affect ones’ health.

(slide 6 shows same data table of racial harassment, discrimination, occupational class, and risk of fair or poor health)
Using data from the same survey he shows that ethnic minorities who believe that most employers discriminate against their ethnic group member report poorer health.

(slide 7)
Finally, he asks whether experiencing physical or verbal racial abuse also results in poorer health among ethnic minorities.
Using data from that survey he shows that is the case. As expected, being the victim of physical attack has a stronger association with poor health than verbal abuse.

There have been a number of studies using UK data mostly from the 1990s which have also shown that there is an association between ethnic and racial harassment and poorer mental and physical health. A study using more recent data showed that this association is stronger if ethnic and racial harassment is experienced repeatedly.

In our project, we were interested in estimating the CAUSAL effect of ethnic and racial harassment on mental ill health, that is not just association. By that I mean while two phenomena may be correlated it does not follow that one causes the other. Earlier studies had shown that there is a correlation between racial harassment and mental health but not if one caused the other. In this project we also wanted to identify if there are any factors that protected people against this possibly negative effect. Finally, we wanted to know if not experiencing this harassment but just being afraid of it also resulted in poorer mental health.

Before I start talking about the harassment and mental health I want to talk a little about the prevalence of ethnic and racial harassment. How common is it?

Let me first talk about measurement of ethnic and racial harassment. As you can see there are a number of steps between an incidence and the incident being reported to the police as a hate crime. Quite often the statistics we see in the media is about hate crimes. As I will show, this is an underestimate of the experiences of harassment faced by people.

After an harassment incident occurs, the person who experiences this must be able to identify this as being driven by racial or ethnic discrimination. The survey data that we have used asks individuals about whether they have been physically or verbally abused and whether they think it is because of their ethnicity, religion, nationality, language or accent, dress or appearance, sex, sexual orientation, disability. The next step is to realise that this is a criminal act and should be reported to the police. Next the person should feel comfortable enough to report to the police. Finally, one needs to know where to report this. After that this act gets recorded as a hate crime.
So, we can see hate crime police reports will be an underestimate of the actual experiences of ethnic and racial harassment.

(slide 14 graph of number of offences vs date)
This is a look at number of racially or religiously aggravated hate crimes around the time of Brexit.
As you may remember news papers reported this spike in hate crimes right after the EU referendum.

(slide 15 graph of offences vs date with specific events noted)
Similar spikes are observed right after specific events.

(slide 16)
Now let's go to surveys. We use data from a UK survey Understanding Society. In 2009, a sub-sample of this survey participants were asked about their experiences of harassment.
Specifically, we consider a person to have experienced ethnic and racial harassment if they said they were physically or verbally attacked in a public place in the last one year AND they think the reason for this was their ethnicity, religion or nationality.

(slide 17)
By public places we mean Streets, Shops, Public Transport, Stations, Taxis, other places

(slide 18 bar graph showing incidents reported by nationality and gender)
In this project we only looked at those who are ethnic minorities, that is, they chose their ethnic group as anything other than white majority or white British.
This graph here shows what proportion of men and women in each ethnic group say they experienced ethnic and racial harassment in the last one year. This ranges from 7% to 17% across different ethnic and gender groups. Also notice that women are less likely to report experiencing harassment. I will talk about the possible reason in a little bit.

(slide 19 same graph)
But these reports are predicated on a person being in a public place and is able to identify an incident as ethnic and racial harassment and then feel confident to report it.

(slide 20 two bar graphs reporting by nationality and gender)
We also asked people if they felt unsafe and avoided places and as you can see almost double the number of people say so. And women are more likely to avoid and feel unsafe in a public place than men. This possibly explains why women are less likely report experiencing harassment...as they tend to avoid being there because they feel unsafe.

(slide 21)
We estimated models to find out what factors affected the chances of experiencing ethnic and racial harassment in the last one year. We found that these following groups of people are more likely to report experiencing:
men, those who are younger than 60+ years, those who are more likely to participate in leisure activities, people with educational qualifications which is GCSE or higher. GCSE is the exam students take in tenth grade. While it is expected that those who are participating in leisure activities will be in public places and so more likely to have such experiences, it is unexpected that those who are more educated are more likely to experience ethnic and racial harassment.

(slide 22)
High prevalence ethnic groups are Chinese, Pakistani and Indian-Muslims. Low prevalence ethnic groups are Indian non-Muslims, Bangladeshi, black Caribbean, black African and Mixed groups.

(slide 23)
Ethnic minorities are more likely to experience harassment if they live in neighbourhoods with lower proportion of their own ethnic group. So maybe there is a safety in numbers. Also note that those who live in areas with higher proportion of white British residents or areas with higher proportion of UKIP/BNP voters in the 2010/2015 elections are also more likely to experience harassment. If you don’t know UKIP/BNP parties these are political parties that are considered to have an overt or covert anti immigrant and racist message. But interestingly there is no association with crime rates in the neighbourhoods.

(slide 24 chart of experience of harassment by changing on aspect of a typical person)
This is to give an idea of the estimated the likelihood of experiences across different groups. For example, 4 out of 100 ethnic minorities without any educational qualification are likely to report harassment. But almost double the number, that is, 9 out of 100 ethnic minorities with GCSE or higher education are likely to experience harassment!

(slide 25 similar slide with different aspects changed)
And a few more scenarios…

(slide 26 similar slide with different aspects changed)
A few more…

[2018/04/21 13:35] LV (lorivonne.lustre): AN: this gives you a feel for how big the differences are

[2018/04/21 13:35] alitanandi Resident: (slide 27)
Now I will talk about the relationship between experiences of ethnic and racial harassment and mental health.

(slide 28)
We measure mental health using a battery of 12 questions. These questions basically measure depression and anxiety.
Based on these questions we derive an overall score which ranges from 0 to 36. Note a higher score means worse mental health!

(slide 29)
Respondents are asked 15 questions to measure the Big Five personality traits – Openness to Experience, Conscientiousness, Extraversion, Agreeableness, Neuroticism.

[2018/04/21 13:36] alitanandi Resident: We control for these factors in models of mental health. All the existing studies we talked about earlier did not control for these factors. As these are likely to be correlated with the likelihood of reporting harassment and mental health, not accounting for it means the estimated association between harassment and mental health could have been reflecting the effect of personality traits on mental health. That is why our models provide better estimates of the CAUSAL effect.

(slide 30)
When we estimate models of mental health we find that ethnic minority women are more likely to have worse mental health than men. Other groups with worse mental health are middle aged people, people with lower incomes, those who are unemployed as compared to employed, those who are separated or divorced as compared to those in partnerships. Interestingly UK born ethnic minorities, also referred to as the second generation, report worse mental health than the first generation, that is, migrants.

(slide 31)
We also see that those who report ethnic and racial harassment report worse mental health than those who don’t report such experiences. What is interesting is that this difference is 1.3 times the difference in mental health between employed and unemployed people. But we don’t find any statistically significant difference in this relationship between first and second generation ethnic minorities.

(slide 32)
Next we ask whether there are individual or social factors that protect the mental health of ethnic minorities against the effect of harassment. We identify some of these resilience or protective factors although what helps for first generation may not be the same as what helps second generation.

(slide 33)
For non-UK born ethnic minorities, that is the first generation, what helps is the proportion of co-ethnic people in their neighbourhoods and the number of close friends they have. What helps for UK born ethnic minorities, that is the second generation, is having a stronger ethnic identity and having a higher proportion of friends of the same ethnic group.

(slide 34)
I want to finish the talk by talking about the ripple effect.

(slide 35 two bar graphs reporting by nationality and gender shown in slide 20)
I had shown this figure earlier.
It shows how there are people who don’t experience harassment but feel unsafe and avoid public places.

(slide 36 Venn diagram with 8% inner experiencing harassment and 12% outer feeling unsafe or avoiding a place)
What we want to know is if this wider group of people also report worse mental health… Hence the ripple effect.

(slide 37 two bar graphs showing predicted increase in mental ill-health)
And we find that is the case.
The mental health cost is higher for those who actually experience ethnic and racial harassment
but as we can see even those who don’t experience this but just feel afraid also report a mental health cost, albeit lower.

(slide 38)
For the first generation (Born outside UK), feeling unsafe without experiencing ERH is half as bad as experiencing it,
but for the second generation (Born in UK), it is almost as bad.

(slide 39 two bar graphs showing mental health cost via family members’ experiences)
We look at another type of ripple effect—the effect on family members.
Because in this survey, we interview all household members, we can do this exercise.
As we can see that among UK born ethnic minorities, if a family member experiences ERH but they don't, even then there is a small but significant mental health effect.

(slide 40)
To conclude, individuals reporting ERH are not necessarily the most disadvantaged.
Also, Risk of harassment is positively associated with certain types of places.

(slide 41)
There is a substantial association of ERH with mental health.
There are also widespread ripple effects.

(slide 42)
Finally, ERH is experienced by a broad population of ethnic minorities, with deleterious effects on mental health, even among those who do not directly experience it.

(slide 43)
Thank you for your time and attention.
Gentle Heron: This is such important information for us in all nations, Alita. Thank you for sharing your research with us.

QUESTION- You said that two resilience factors for racial/ethnic minorities are “having a stronger ethnic identity and having a higher proportion of friends of the same ethnic group.” Might this also apply to people with disabilities? Do you think we will be more resilient if we have a stronger disability identity and more friends with disabilities?

Elektra Panthar: AN: Interesting question. We haven't looked at that specifically. We asked about being harassed if disabled but we aren't able to measure it in measure of disability identity.

LV (lorivonne.lustre): GH: How would you measure the strength of disability identity?

Elektra Panthar: AN: For ERH we had focus groups, how important is your ethnic background for your identity?

LV (lorivonne.lustre): GH: could we ask the audience here those 2 questions?

Elektra Panthar: AN: We would have to do focus groups to know. Yes, we could do it with the audience.

Gentle Heron: I own my disability publicly. It is part of who I am.

Eme Capalini: on a scale of?

LV (lorivonne.lustre): GH: How important is your disability to who you are? on a scale of 1-4, with 4 being the most important

alitanandi: 4 very important

3 fairly important

2 not important

1 not at all important

alitanandi: How important is your disability to your sense of who you are?

Orange Planer: Important. It's part of my mental perception of myself.

4

Gentle Heron: OK so on the scale, for me, it's 4

Mook Wheeler: Very important --- in that without my autism I would not be who I am. 10/10

Suellen Heartsong (suln.mahogany): I agree, without my disability, I would not be who I am. so 4 for me as well

Jeff (jefferr): 3

Jack Ryan (james2010.mint): 2

Gloriejoy (joycie.string): medium

B O S S C O M B E E (deidre.frost): 3.75

iSkye Silverweb: 8/10

Jennifer Nicole Ella Rose (jennifemicoleellarose): I have accepted my disability as part of who I am. I would not be who I am without it. It is the same with my mental illness

Treasure Ballinger: also agree with 8/10
[2018/04/21 13:48] LV (lorivonne.lustre): GH: I am showing you Alita how easy it is to conduct a focus group in a virtual world
[2018/04/21 13:48] Elektra Panthar: AN: I can see (how easy it is to conduct focus groups in virtual worlds)
[2018/04/21 13:48] OperativePhoenix: I can't really think of it in numbers
[2018/04/21 13:49] Orange Planer: Then you get smart alecks like me who skew the results on purpose.

It might work for some disabilities as some are inherited
[2018/04/21 13:50] Elektra Panthar: AN: If one or more parents have the same disability as you, how important is it to you on a scale of 1 to 10?
How important... meaning, how strongly do I identify with my parents?
[2018/04/21 13:51] Elektra Panthar: AN: Not identifying with your parents, identifying with the disability your parents have
[2018/04/21 13:50] iSkye Silverweb: I don't know if mine is inherited. I don't know, if mine is inherited through a parent
[2018/04/21 13:51] Elektra Panthar: AN: Not sure this is the right way of asking
[2018/04/21 13:52] Orange Planer: Well... my parents had two different issues. Dad was ADHD, Mom was on the depression spectrum. All of us kids have various different issues. All related.
[2018/04/21 13:52] Suellen Heartsong (suln.mahogany): mine is inherited but I don't think that made me identify with my parents, especially my father as I never met him
[2018/04/21 13:52] Mook Wheeler: No one else in my family has ASD

[2018/04/21 13:52] Gentle Heron: We could ask the audience how else we could determine the strength of identification as a person with a disability.
[2018/04/21 13:52] LV (lorivonne.lustre): GH: that might not work as a parallel question I will ask the audience which measures they would use
[2018/04/21 13:53] Gentle Heron: How would you measure that, Orange?
The question is what's the scale?


[2018/04/21 13:54] Orange Planer: I absolutely wouldn't be who I am without my disabilities. They're all MENTAL!
Yes, I admit it, I'm mental. :D

[2018/04/21 13:54] LV (lorivonne.lustre): GH: I would like to encourage Alita to do research with us

[2018/04/21 13:54] SunTzu (joey.aboma): I think avatar identity is the critical first part of the whole virtual experience
It all starts there

[2018/04/21 13:54] Elektra Panthar: AN: I would like to do this. I haven't thought about identity of many dimensions; I'd like to know how important it is to you, for your own sense of identity

[2018/04/21 13:54] Gentle Heron: Does it matter if you have a disability from birth, or if you acquire your disability later?

[2018/04/21 13:54] Mook Wheeler: I think Orange's question has a lot to do with WHEN you acquired the disability, or was born with it, or how much it impacts your life -- all that influences the identification. People who get disabled late in life often identify less with their disability, especially if it is acquired. It also depends on the TYPE of disability -- whether by disease, or accident, or something else
And whether it carries pain with it or not, and similar questions

[2018/04/21 13:56] OperativePhoenix: Mook might be onto something there. Mine is acquired later and I don't know what to think about my condition

[2018/04/21 13:55] Elektra Panthar: AN: This would be something we'd have to ask a lot of people with time variation, and measure it
Any other suggestions?

[2018/04/21 13:55] Jennifer Nicole Ella Rose (jennifernicoleellarose): If I may add: I think a lot of it has to do with our perception and acceptance of our disability, especially if it is a mental one
Although I have accepted it and others see it at times in my life, I have never used it as a barrier in any way
The first step is acceptance. Without that, the process can not continue

[2018/04/21 13:56] LV (lorivonne.lustre): GH: there are a couple of comments here that may be helpful
Repeats what Mook and Jennifer say

[2018/04/21 13:56] Treasure Ballinger: My hearing loss was acquired, in my 30's, and is not inherited, however, it's become a huge part of my identity, I live inside of it......


For me it can get in the way, but I get through it positively
[2018/04/21 13:57] LV (lorivonne.lustre): GH: there is some great language here that you could use in refining the questions
There is a lot to work with here

[2018/04/21 13:58] MatildaMoontree: I do see mine as a barrier, as restrictive in my life

[2018/04/21 13:58] Mook Wheeler: People with disabilities with severe chronic pain may have a less positive view of their condition than others who don't have pain, who are happier to see their disability as their identity

[2018/04/21 13:58] iSkye Silverweb: I was born profoundly deaf, became completely deaf later in life as an adult. I had a version of 'normal' that I've lost so my disability is one that isolates me in the physical world.

[2018/04/21 13:58] Jennifer Nicole Ella Rose (jennifernicoleellarose): Anyone with a disability can not only accept, but overcome it. Although the methods to do so differ from person to person

[2018/04/21 13:58] Elektra Panthar: AN: It's also about your attitude toward the group, some would incorporate a negative attitude others have toward that group for example

[2018/04/21 13:58] LV (lorivonne.lustre): GH: are there any other questions? Mook? I think you had a good one

[2018/04/21 13:58] Mook Wheeler: er, can't remember what it was

[2018/04/21 13:59] LV (lorivonne.lustre): GH: yes, you were talking about spikes after events


[2018/04/21 13:59] Elektra Panthar: AN: When these events happen there's a spike, then it goes down. But from police reports we saw that it never goes down to zero

Numbers are similar (1 in 10) both for a study done in the 00s and in the 90s

[2018/04/21 13:59] MatildaMoontree: I can attest to harassment after events, personally. After the Iran Hostage Crisis in 1979, and after 9-11

[2018/04/21 14:00] Mook Wheeler: OBSERVATION: It is my belief that racism is *extremely* skewed towards the VISUAL. You noted that 4 out of 100 ethnic minorities without any educational qualifications report harassment. In my own experience, you do not even need to open your mouth to get harassed. The aggressors have no idea what my educational level is, nor do they care. Often, they just take a look at my face and get nasty, be it with 'microaggressions' like ignore me at the supermarket till and speak to my white husband, or engage in more explicit harassment like calling me names. *shrug*

[2018/04/21 14:01] MatildaMoontree: Indeed, it is visual, in my personal experience. During the Iran Hostage Crisis, racists went to apartment complexes looking for "Iranian looking names" and then proceeded to throw things through windows, etc. (in Denver and elsewhere)

So, even the "visual appearance in a name" is a target

[2018/04/21 14:02] Elektra Panthar: AN: When I was showing the differences, I was trying to say that people who have higher education are more likely to report it, are more in public spaces, and are confident enough to report it

[2018/04/21 14:02] iSkye Silverweb: more aware and more able to identify it as harassment?
Elektra Panthar: AN: People don't report things they think are normalized. They expect to be harassed.

Mook Wheeler: I often think that if these aggressors could not SEE their 'victims', what might be the level of racism?

Gentle Heron: https://www.theguardian.com/society/2011/sep/12/disabled-people-face-abuse-routinely

LV (lorivonne.lustre): GH: that is a link to an article -- it says that people with disabilities expect to be abused. I wonder if anyone in our audience have had that experience?

iSkye Silverweb: harassment can be very subtle.

Elektra Panthar: AN: It also comes from hearing, language and accents, so it also happens across regions. That's why we can't include that in our measurements, because it happens among the white majority too when based on accent.

Missy D (mistressvengeance): yes my accent is a giveaway.

James Heartsong (peacefuljames): I wonder... When I was growing up, I was often attacked, simply because I was 'the new guy' in that area. Also, there were times when I was attacked, simply because I was white. How does that figure in here? ... I suspect humans, like wolves, often attack those who are different.

LV (lorivonne.lustre): GH: so not just ethnic background? James' comment and question.

Orange Planer: That's common. The alienation of the "other."

Or the unknown.

Mook Wheeler: yes, Orange, it goes back to the politics of the Other. But seeing and hearing are the FRONTLINE factors for racist actions.

iSkye Silverweb: I've been stared at and made fun of because I use American Sign Language to communicate with friends in the physical world, or use interpreters in certain settings.

Jennifer Nicole Ella Rose (jennifemicoleellarose): I was picked on early in life, in high school, but by the time of graduation, I had built up the self-confidence and a different perception. I had gained trust and respect from others. They knew how hard I worked to do so.

Elektra Panthar: AN: We haven't looked at that. There are studies about bullying at school. It seems it happens both ways, but I haven't looked at it closely so I can't comment.

LV (lorivonne.lustre): GH: reading comments from Jennifer.

Elektra Panthar: AN: I'd like to ask how she got that strength, that resilience.

Jennifer Nicole Ella Rose (jennifemicoleellarose): Acceptance is always only PART of the equation. I built up a mentality, a no nonsensse attitude. Not only that, I stood up for others who had disabilities far worse than I.

LV (lorivonne.lustre): GH: what are other parts of the equation Jennifer?
Jennifer Nicole Ella Rose (jennifemicoleellarose): Acceptance, confidence, strength
and mindset. Those are the ones I can think of right now
Elektra Panthar: AN: Others have looked at the reaction to harassment. If you are proactive your mental health improves
Jennifer Nicole Ella Rose (jennifemicoleellarose): Anybody can overcome whatever obstacle they choose to. But we have to have that mindset to do so
And embracing change. Not fearing the unknown
It is often our fear of the unknown that holds us back
Shyla the Super Gecko (krjon): that is interesting
Gloriejoy (joycie.string): A COMMENT- It takes less effort and is more fun to just be nice to all! Love goes a long way. :)